

# Tenure: Making Sense of the Source Documents

(Or who made up all these rules anyway?)  
Revision August 2009

## *Policies of the Board of Trustees of the State University of New York*

[http://www.suny.edu/Board\\_of\\_Trustees/PDF/Policies.pdf](http://www.suny.edu/Board_of_Trustees/PDF/Policies.pdf)

### **Article XI.** Appointment of Employees

- President must consider recommendation of committees of the appropriate department [APT]

### **Article XII.** Evaluation and Promotion of Academic & Professional Employees

- Mastery of subject matter
- Effectiveness of teaching
- Scholarly Ability (research & publication)
- Effectiveness of University Service
- Continuing growth

## *Agreement Between the State of New York and United University Professions, 2007-2011*

<http://www.uupinfo.org/contract/text.html>

- See **Article 30. Appointment, Evaluation & Promotion**
- See also **Article 33. Job Security Review Procedures**
- **Guide for Academics at SUNY** <http://www.uupinfo.org/reports/guides/acadguide.pdf>

## *University at Buffalo's Policies, Procedures and Criteria for Faculty Personnel Actions (PPC) – found in the Part III.A of the UB Faculty Staff Handbook at*

<http://www.business.buffalo.edu/UbbContent/Hrs/facultyhandbook/III.htm>

### III. University at Buffalo Academic Policies

#### III.A University at Buffalo PPC.

(The PPC is a separate document with its own outline numbering; don't get confused!)

#### Introduction

##### I. CRITERIA

“developed by an individual department...for the use of all higher faculty review bodies.”

“contextual guidelines regarding the evaluation of faculty for...tenure”

“Instead of traditional teaching, library faculty should be evaluated on the performance of the basic function of the librarian.”

##### II. PROCEDURES

“Procedures and standards followed by individual departments...during review may supplement these policies...”

##### III. THE PROMOTION DOSSIER

***Bylaws of the Faculty of the University Libraries, University at Buffalo***

June 2009 revision

<http://libweb.lib.buffalo.edu/sw/services/hr/fecBylaws.pdf>

The dossier consists of written materials intended to inform all levels of participation in the peer review process. It is the responsibility of the Unit Director to assemble the initial documentation. Additional materials are added to the dossier at each step of the process. Procedures for preparing and transmitting the dossier are found in the [\*Standing Rules of the University Libraries Appointment, Promotion and Tenure Committee\*](#)

***Standing Rules of the University Libraries Appointment, Promotion and Tenure Committee,***

September 2009 revision

<http://libweb.lib.buffalo.edu/sw/services/hr/standingRules.pdf>

***University at Buffalo Criteria for Library Faculty Personnel Actions***

June 2009 revision

<http://libweb.lib.buffalo.edu/sw/services/hr/libcriteria.pdf>

***Evaluating Electronic Products for Dossiers: Guidelines for Unit Heads, Directors, and Candidates***

<http://libweb.lib.buffalo.edu/sw/committees/apt/dossier/evalwebprod.pdf>

## V.B. Information Included in the Dossier

The following chart summarizes the **minimum content of the dossier** at the APT level of review

Source: *Standing Rules of the University Libraries Appointment, Promotion and Tenure Committee, Sept. 2009 rev.*

APPOINTMENT		
no PRB review	Appointment at Assistant, Senior Assistant, or Associate ranks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Dossier Preparer's letter.</li> <li>• The position description used in recruitment.</li> <li>• The candidate's curriculum vitae.</li> <li>• Three (3) letters of reference and copies of the letters requesting the references.</li> </ul>
no PRB review	Appointment for part-time term positions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Dossier Preparer's letter.</li> <li>• The position description used in recruitment.</li> <li>• The candidate's curriculum vitae.</li> <li>• Suitable references, if requested</li> </ul>
PRB review required	Appointment at Librarian rank	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Dossier Preparer's letter</li> <li>• The position description used in recruitment.</li> <li>• The candidate's curriculum vitae.</li> <li>• Letters of reference must include the following. (see <i>PPC</i>, III.B.6-8)               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Two (2) letters from colleagues who currently work with the candidate.</li> <li>○ Four (4) letters from evaluators from leading public research institutions which indicate whether the candidacy would be successful at the evaluator's institution.</li> <li>○ A description of the external evaluators and of the method of selecting the evaluators.</li> <li>○ Copies of letters requesting references.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
REAPPOINTMENT		
no PRB review	Reappointments at Senior Assistant or Associate rank	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The candidate's employment history.</li> <li>• The Dossier Preparer's letter.</li> <li>• The Conditions of Employment Letter if appointed on or after January 1, 1989, or if responsibilities changed substantially after that date. A position description will be substituted for all other candidates.</li> <li>• The candidate's curriculum vitae.</li> <li>• Three (3) letters of reference, at least one of which must be from a member of the University Libraries Faculty or Professional staff, and copies of the letters requesting the references.</li> <li>• The candidate's statement of research interests (tenure-track only).</li> <li>• The candidate's service statement.</li> </ul>
PRB review required	Reappointments at the rank of Librarian	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The <i>PPC</i> makes no provision for a reappointment at the rank of Librarian. Although logically possible, it seems unlikely that a reappointment without the simultaneous granting of continuing appointment would be proposed.</li> </ul>

<b>PROMOTION</b>		
no PRB review	Promotions to the rank of Senior Assistant Librarian	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The candidate's employment history.</li> <li>• The Dossier Preparer's letter.</li> <li>• Any mandatory line supervisor letter(s).</li> <li>• The candidate's Conditions of Employment Letter.</li> <li>• The candidate's curriculum vitae.</li> <li>• Three (3) letters of reference, at least one of which must be from a member of the University Libraries Faculty or Professional staff, and copies of the letters requesting the references.</li> <li>• The candidate's statement of research interests (tenure-track only).</li> <li>• The candidate's service statement.</li> </ul>
no PRB review	Promotion to the rank of Associate Librarian - <b>without continuing appointment</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All items required for promotion to Senior Assistant Librarian.</li> <li>• Convincing evidence from evaluators outside the University Libraries of the candidate's excellence. (4 letters)</li> </ul>
PRB review required	Promotion to the rank of Associate Librarian - <b>with continuing appointment</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Same as those required for granting of continuing appointment.</li> </ul>
PRB review required	Promotion to the rank of Librarian	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All items required for appointment at the rank of Librarian, excepting that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The Conditions of Employment Letter rather than the position description is supplied.</li> <li>○ The candidate's statement of research interests and service is added.</li> <li>○ The candidate's employment history is added.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<b>CONTINUING APPOINTMENT (TENURE)</b>		
PRB review required	Granting of continuing appointment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The candidate's employment history.</li> <li>• The Dossier Preparer's letter.</li> <li>• Any mandatory line supervisor letter(s).</li> <li>• The candidate's curriculum vitae.</li> <li>• A minimum of two (2) letters of reference from members of the University Libraries Faculty or Professional staff.</li> <li>• A minimum of four (4) letters from evaluators from leading public research institutions which indicate whether the candidacy would be successful at the evaluators institution.</li> <li>• A description of the external evaluators and of the method of selecting the evaluators.</li> <li>• Copies of letters requesting references.</li> <li>• The candidate's statement of research interests.</li> <li>• The candidate's service statement.</li> </ul>

## University Libraries Faculty Personnel Actions

### Summary of Review Process

NON-PRESIDENT'S REVIEW BOARD CASES	PRESIDENT'S REVIEW BOARD CASES
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• appointments</li> <li>• reappointments</li> <li>• promotion to Associate Librarian <b>without</b> continuing appointment</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• continuing appointments</li> <li>• promotion to Librarian (with or without continuing appointment)</li> <li>• appointment at the rank of Librarian (with or without continuing appointment)</li> </ul>
1. Preparation of documentation	1. Preparation of documentation
2. Unit meeting and vote: (rank on rank voting, excluding those voting at APT/PRB).  Unit Director and supervisor must attend meeting.	2. Unit meeting and vote: Unit Director and supervisor must attend meeting (Unit Director cannot vote)  <i>All Ranks except Librarian:</i> (rank on rank voting, excluding those voting at APT <i>Librarian</i> (no vote at the rank of Librarian; meeting is solely advisory)
3. Supervisor letter, if applicable (including transmission of letter to candidate)	3. Supervisor letter, if applicable (including transmission of letter to candidate)
4. Unit Director letter (includes unit vote) (including transmission of letter to candidate)	4. Unit Director letter (includes unit vote) (including transmission of letter to candidate)
5. Libraries-wide Faculty vote: not applicable	5. <i>Associate Librarian</i>  Libraries-wide Faculty vote: (rank on rank voting, excluding those voting at unit or APT)  <i>Librarian</i> Full Librarian Review Panel vote
6. APT	6. APT (no consideration for rank of Librarian)
7. AVPUL	7. AVPUL (includes all votes taken) (including transmission of letter to candidate)
	8. PRB
	9. Provost/Vice Provost
	10. President

Rank-on-rank voting – see *Bylaws*, Section III.A.2

APT Appointment, Promotion & Tenure Committee  
 AVPUL Associate Vice President for University Libraries  
 PRB President's Review Board